



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Journal of Economics, Management & Trade
Manuscript Number:	2013_BJEMT_7570
Title of the Manuscript:	Stakeholders' Perception on Self Help Group's Quality Parameters: A Psychometrics Analysis

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The manuscript is much improved, and due to the statistical significance of the hypothesis regarding QAP-II, I can recommend publication. Technical issues are almost completely corrected and proper evaluation of the conducted research is now possible. There are, however, some minor revisions to be made. Abstract: Study Design states “based on empiricism” – do you mean “empirical <u>method</u>”? “specially structured questionnaires were prepared which <u>was</u> later” should be “were”, preferably “and were” instead of “which” – currently the sentence is <u>awkward</u> “Chroabanch alpha” should be Cronbach's <u>alpha</u> “Eta Test” – you probably mean that “magnitude of the effect was provided by means of eta-<u>squared</u>” “It was observed from KW Test that there exists enough evidence to conclude that there is a no difference” – as I mentioned earlier, a Kruskal-Wallis test is not enough to conclude a lack of difference, unless it is either coupled with enough statistical power (eta) or tested by means of Bayesian probability of a no-difference <u>hypothesis</u>. Line 136: “The country like India” – awkward statement; perhaps “in India” would suffice, or use a more generalized statement of what you mean by “like <u>India</u>” Lines 231-246, Figure 1: The QAP parameters are still described as numbers – what information does it provide? Wouldn't it be better to use the statements in this paragraph? The tables describing these parameters are at the very end of the <u>manuscript</u>.	Comment [S1]: . The word "empirical" is commonly used interchangeably with the word "observable." However, the original meaning of empiricism included proofs establishes through any of the senses: seeing, hearing, tasting, touching, and smelling. After empirical experiments are administered and data is systematically gathered, the scientist must then "interpret" the data, . . . for data cannot speak for itself. This means Empiricism cannot function without inevitably invoking Rationalism — consistency in the logical interpretation of empirical data. Further, Empiricists assume that the senses can adequately access tangible reality in a consistent fashion. This is called the "empirical assumption." By accepting the "empirical assumption," science excuses itself from philosophical inquiry and proceeds to examine the tangible world using systematic methods that verify to the senses patterns of consistency within the physical world — patterns that are sometimes assumed to have universal application. Keeping in mind all these things the word “Empiricism” is used in this study. Comment [S2]: Properly addressed Comment [S3]: Properly addressed Comment [S4]: Eta is the ratio of the between sum of squares to total sum of squares in analysis of variance. Eta, the coefficient of nonlinear correlation, known as the correlation ratio, is discussed in the section on analysis of variance. The extent to which eta is greater than r is an estimate of the extent to which the data relationship is nonlinear. Eta was used to investigate the strength of the association between nominal and interval data. A common derivation of eta is eta squared, which is similar to r² in its underlying interpretation. Thus, eta squared refers to the amount of variation in the dependent variable that is accounted for by the independent variable. Directional measure of Eta helps to determine how much the dependent variable is affected by the independent variable. A value of 0 means the independent variable does it help to predict the dependent variable & a value of 1 means the independent variable perfectly predicts the resulting dependent variable. Eta and Eta squared are also produced by SPSS when an analysis of variance is resulted in association with the means. (Alan Bryman, Duncan Cramer, Quantitative Data Analysis with IBM SPSS 17, 18 & 19: A Guide for Social statistics; George A. Morgan, Nancy L. Leech, Gene W. Gloeckner, Karen C. Barrett, IBM SPSS for Introductory Statistics: Use and Interpretation, Fourth Edition, Routledge). However, in manuscript facts about predictability and a table measuring association (eta squared) is inserted in page/line- 26 for better understanding. Comment [S5]: Acknowledged Comment [S6]: Properly addressed Comment [S7]: Properly addressed ignoring the space constraints (Line 235-283)



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

Line 282: What is the point of stating the null hypothesis? H1 provides all the needed information, and H0 is only of methodological importance, and only if NHST methods are applied	Comment [S8]: deleted
Line 290: “The research design...” – the statement is unnecessary, and awkward from a language point of view	Comment [S9]: Deleted
Lines 326 and 329 provide contradictory data on the number of collected questionnaires: 116 vs 100. Also, “86% response rate” without the “of”.	Comment [S10]: Yes 116 is collected out of which 100 found suitable for using in the study, hence response rate in pure sense of the term is 86.21% [16 questionnaires are not properly fill up, information suppressed etc.]/ corrected.
335: questionnaires were collected (please stick to the past tense)	Comment [S11]: Complied
374-383: is the geographic information about Nagaon important for the study? If yes, how? If no, please consider shortening or deleting it	Comment [S12]: Geographic information about Nagaon, i.e. the study area is considered necessary as it is able to provide exact location of the area and other socio-economic parameters may be collected from other sources. Further, profile of study area is important because result of the study may differ in context other country or even region to region within a country itself. Geographic information is considered necessary to identify the study area within the globe, even regardless of whether it has any effect on the obtained result, as it is just a good practice. Further, it is considered customary in many international journals of repute to include a section about the Geographic information about the study area. Even then the paragraph little bit shortened.
Age composition: I still suggest means and SD’s for the total sample, as it enables the readers to properly evaluate the sample (regardless of whether age has any effect on the obtained results, it is just good practice).	Comment [S13]: Included into the text in line/page no. 422/12
430: “Caste is the social variable in India” – the statement does not really help understand the composition in Table 7	Comment [S14]: The Scheduled Castes [Scheduled Caste Welfare - List of Scheduled Castes". Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment] and Scheduled Tribes (STs) are two groups of historically-disadvantaged people recognised in the Constitution of India. During the period of British rule in the Indian sub-continent, they were known as the Depressed Classes. The Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes comprise about 16.6 percent and 8.6 percent, respectively, of India's population (or about 25.2 percent altogether, according to the 2011 census).The Constitution (Scheduled Castes) Order, 1950 lists 1,108 castes across 25 states in its First Schedule, and the Constitution (Scheduled Tribes) Order, 1950 lists 744 tribes across 22 states in its First Schedule. Since independence, the Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes were given reservation in India. The reservation policy became an integral part of the Constitution through the efforts of Bhimrao Ambedkar, who participated in the Round Table Conferences and fought for the rights of the oppressed and depressed classes. The Constitution lays down the general principles of affirmative action for SCs and STs. Govt of India has mandated a planning process for the social, economic and educational development of Scheduled Castes and improvement in their working and living conditions. (See details in http://censusindia.gov.in/Census.../scheduled_castes_and_scheduled_tribes.aspx ; socialjustice.nic.in/policiesacts1.php). As these things i.e. caste like SC, STs; communities (OBC, MOBC) etc. which are the social variable in India are well documented in various international journals of repute particularly in the branch of social science studies. Considering these variables as common issues of India’s demographic characteristics which are well acquitted by the international readers hence considered justified for shortening (Table 7). Even then, few lines are incorporated in line 461-468.
683: “we drafted...” should be “a pool of (...) was drafted – I would recommend sticking to impersonal sentences throughout the manuscript	Comment [S15]: Properly addressed
693: “relevance” instead of “relevancy”	Comment [S16]: Properly addressed
Table 26: just checking, are these numbers really that high? Is it eta-squared or just eta correlation?	Comment [S17]: Details in Comment S 4/ Eta squared value is also incorporated. Line 805-810
788: “nascent stage”, “common yardstick” – please consider using more direct language	Comment [S18]: Properly addressed.
814: “groups of QAP-I are more decisive...” – don’t the results state the exact opposite, that QAP-II provides the significant differences?	Comment [S19]: Properly addressed.



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

817-826: Are descriptions of basic statistical theory necessary?	
Some minor language errors are present in some parts of the manuscript, please consider reading it thoroughly and correcting these errors.	

Comment [S20]: Since there are different school of thoughts, hence brief descriptions of these may resolve readers problem.

Comment [S21]: Checked